It’s Not How You Start, It’s How You Finish?: Integrated Systems and Supports for Developmental Education

La’Tara Osborne-Lampkin, Ph.D.
Tamara Bertrand Jones, Ph.D.
Acknowledgement and Disclaimer

Information and materials for this presentation are supported by IES/NCEE’s Regional Educational Laboratory Southeast at Florida State University (Contract ED-IES-17-C-0011) as resources and examples for the viewer's convenience. Their inclusion is not intended as an endorsement by the Regional Educational Laboratory Southeast or its funding source, the Institute of Education Sciences.

In addition, the instructional practices and assessments discussed or shown in this presentation are not intended to mandate, direct, or control a State’s, local educational agency’s, or school’s specific instructional content, academic achievement system and assessments, curriculum, or program of instruction. State and local programs may use any instructional content, achievement system and assessments, curriculum, or program of instruction they wish.
Developmental Education and the Policy Environment
Minority Serving Institutions in the Developmental Education Policy Environment

State Policy

Institutional Goals
Session Goals

• Review evidence-based practices for planning and implementing integrated systems for developmental education
• Review evidence-based strategies to support developmental education students
• Reflect on evidence practices and institutional context
Evidence-Based Practices to Support Developmental Education Implementation
Modality Choices

• Compressed
• Contextualized
• Modularized
• Co-requisite
Compressed

- Combine two developmental education courses into one course offered in same semester
- May help students facilitate better relationships with faculty (Edgecombe, 2011)
- Accelerated Learning Program in Baltimore students were more likely to complete first and second college-level English courses (Cho, Kopko, Jenkins, & Jaggars, 2012)
- FastStart students at the Community College of Denver completed more developmental math courses, earned more developmental math credits, and were more likely to pass college-level math courses (Bragg, 2009).
Contextualized

- Assist students in connecting academic content within a practical (occupational) context
- I-BEST Program in Washington pairs academic content instructor with career instructor to team teach (Zeidenberg, Cho, & Jenkins, 2010)
- May increase students’ basic skills and students’ knowledge in a particular major/course pathway (Rutschow & Schneider, 2011)
Modularized

- Break course material into smaller instructional units
- Courses begin with diagnostic assessments to identify student’s strengths and weaknesses
- Many modularized courses are technology-based (Epper & Baker, 2009)
- Math courses that use Assessment and Learning in Knowledge Spaces (ALEKS) increased math self-efficacy, reading, and critical thinking (Foshee, Elliott, & Atkinson, 2015)
Co-requisite

- Combines college-level instruction with additional mandatory supports (Edgecombe, 2011)
- Supports include companion classes, lab sessions, or others
- In Tennessee developmental math and writing co-requisite courses were cost-effective (Belfield, Jenkins, & Lahr, 2016)
Evidence-Based Practices to Support Developmental Education
Exploring Promising Practices for Developmental Education Programs

- Program Management & Organization
- Assessment, Instruction, & Curriculum
- Student Supports
- Faculty
- Roles of Public Policy

(Schwartz & Jenkins, 2007)
Innovation and Research Driven Practices

- Instructional programs that accelerate students through core material (Jaggars, Edgecombe, Stacy, 2014)
- Learning communities (Bloom & Sommo, 2005)
- Learning environments (Ashby, Sadera, & McNary, 2011)
- Evidence-based supports (Bremer, et al, 2013)
  - Tutoring
  - Counseling
  - Use of learning labs and computer labs
  - Advising
- Integrated systems with multiple supports (Grubb & Cox, 2005)
Commonly Integrated Supports

- **Coaching** (Bettinger & Baker, 2013; Klempin & Karp, 2015; Rogers, Blunt, & Trible, 2014).
- **Degree Mapping** (Richardson, 2014).
- **Advising** (Fletcher & Karp, 2015; Kalamkarian & Karp, 2015; Klempin & Karp, 2015).
Influencers of Student Course Decisions

- Academic Pathways
- Communication & Collaboration with Faculty
- Modality Choices

Hueristic based on Hu, Bertrand Jones, Brower, Park, Nix, Rahming, Harrison, Sermon, & Daniels, 2017.
Research to Inform Developmental Education Programs

What Works Clearinghouse: Strategies for Post-Secondary Students in Developmental Education
EDUCATOR’S PRACTICE GUIDE
A set of recommendations to address challenges in classrooms and schools

WHAT WORKS CLEARINGHOUSE™

Strategies for Postsecondary Students in Developmental Education – A Practice Guide for College and University Administrators, Advisors, and Faculty

Educators’ Practice Guide Summary • WHAT WORKS CLEARINGHOUSE™
Overview of Institute for Education Sciences Practice Guides

- What is a practice guide?
- How are practice guides developed?
- Levels of evidence for What Works Clearinghouse practice guides
- Recommendations
Introduction to the Practice Guide on Strategies for Students in Developmental Education

• Two distinct sets of evidence-based practices
  • Instructional interventions
  • Structural interventions
WWC Summary of Recommendations


2. Recommendation 2: Require or incentivize regular participation in enhanced advising activities.


4. Recommendation 4: Compress or mainstream developmental education with course redesign.

5. Recommendation 5: Teach students how to become self-regulated learners.

6. Recommendation 6: Implement comprehensive, integrated, and long-lasting support systems.

(The National Center for Education Evaluation and Regional Assistance, 2016)
Reviewing Institutional Practices and Data in the Context of WWC Recommendations

- How is this recommendation currently being implemented at my institution?
- What data are currently being collected to track this information and/or facilitate processes related to this recommendation?
Recommendation One

Use multiple measures to assess post-secondary readiness and place students.
Figure 1.1. Types of measures to assess college readiness and place students into courses

**Types of Measures to Assess College Readiness and Place Students into Courses**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Letter Grade</th>
<th>GPA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>4.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>3.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>1.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
<td>0.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Score on an approved college readiness test**

1. A
2. B
3. C
4. D
5. E

**Completion of, or grade in, a specified high school course or course sequence**

- Algebra
- Biology
- English II
- U.S. History
- A+
- A+
- B-
- B+

**Work/life experience** (e.g., military, participation in juried competitions)

- A - Past learning
- B - Life experiences
- C - Careers
- D - Professional training

**Assessment score on a non-cognitive measure**

- A - Academic motivation
- B - Confidence and self-efficacy
- C - Study skills and work ethic
Recommendation One

Use multiple measures to assess post-secondary readiness and place students.

Explore potential additional measures that faculty and administration believe might inform placement.

Use a pilot period to study the placement rates and success rates of students involving different placement methods at your institution.

After implementation, investigate the effects of the multiple measures policy on desired student outcomes over time.

Consider how college-readiness policies and practices in your state and local area impact the parameters of decision-making and implementation of multiple measures.
Recommendation

Two

Require or incentivize regular participation in enhanced advising activities.
Figure 2.1. Sample enhanced advising planning tool

**Sample Enhanced Advising Tool**

**Advisor’s Role and Preferred Contact Information**

- **Student Name and Preferred Contact Info:**
- **Advisor Name and Preferred Contact Info:**

**Advisor’s Role**

- Discuss short- and long-term goals.
- Address concerns and barriers to achieving goals.
- Listen to and provide support for the student’s plan of action.
- Recommend resources and supports to address barriers and concerns.
- Help student set realistic, achievable timelines and meet necessary deadlines.
- Set up next check-in time to discuss progress toward goals, completed actions, and new actions to be taken.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>My Goal or Concern</th>
<th>My Plan of Action</th>
<th>My Timeline/Expected Completion Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Recommendation
Three

Offer students performance-based monetary incentives
Recommendation Three

Offer students performance-based monetary incentives.

How to carry out recommendation

Design and structure payments of students’ performance-based incentives to yield students a net financial gain.

Distribute payments incrementally, according to specific desired performance benchmarks.

Target incentives to low-income students.

Provide student support services, in conjunction with performance-based incentives.
Check Point...Practices and Data in the Context

• How are these recommendations currently being implemented at my institution?

• What data are currently being collected to track this information and/or facilitate processes related to this recommendation?
Recommendation
Four

Compress or mainstream developmental education with course redesign.

Figure 4.1. Student success through accelerated coursework
Inventory of strategies currently in place for accelerating students’ progress through developmental education.\textsuperscript{85}

\textbf{Do you already have}

- Self-placement options for students to reduce need for placement into developmental education?

- Compressed developmental education curriculum, with rigorous course content aligned with transfer-level and career/technical fields?

- Provision of additional student supports integrated with coursework?

- Integration of skill-building in English and math within credit-bearing courses, aligned with students’ academic and career interests?

- Monitoring of student progress at regular, frequent intervals based on student mastery of content rather than seat time?
Recommendation Five

Teach students how to become self-regulated learners.
Recommendation Five

Teach students how to become self-regulated learners.

How to carry out recommendation

Encourage students to improve their estimation of their current capabilities.

Integrate monitoring and reflecting on the learning process with coursework or course content.

Present students with examples and models of how to monitor and reflect in the course subject matter.
Figure 5.1. Overview of the self-regulated learning process

**INSTRUCTORS**
- Evaluate effectiveness of the curriculum, instruction, and assessment practices.
- Modify course as needed.
- Facilitate students’ self-regulated learning skills with all assignments.
- Work with other instructors to reinforce these practices.

**STUDENTS**
- Set processing goals to implement a learning strategy.
- Self-observe your strategic behavior and outcomes.

**PRACTICE**
- Review prior performance.
- Conduct a task analysis.
- Select strategies.
- Set goals and confidence estimates.

**PLAN**
- Plan how to integrate self-regulated learning in course components.
- Make predictions and confidence estimates.

**EVALUATE**
- Self-evaluate strategy use and goal achievement.
- Maintain or adapt the strategy.
Recommendation

Six

Implement comprehensive, integrated, and long-lasting support systems.
Figure 6.2. Illustrative example of comprehensive, integrated, and long-lasting supports

Illustrative Example of Comprehensive, Integrated, and Long-Lasting Supports

Graduate in three years

- **Student Services** (Enhanced Advising, Tutoring, Career Services)
- **Requirements & Messaging** (Full-Time Enrollment, Take Developmental Courses Early, Graduate in 3 Years)
- **Cohort-based Classes** (Student Success Seminar, Block-Scheduled Classes, Early Registration)
- **Financial Supports** (Tuition Waiver, Free Public Transportation Cards, Free Textbooks)

Long-Lasting Support

Strong, Collaborative Organizational Structure that Uses Data to Inform Practice
Recommendation Six

Implement comprehensive, integrated, and long-lasting support systems.

How to carry out the recommendation

- Develop a strong, collaborative organizational structure that uses data to inform practice.
- Clearly communicate expectations to students. Require or incentivize in-person advising meetings.
- Design course enrollment strategically.
- Decide which student support services will be provided and how to ensure that students participate.
- Provide performance-based monetary incentives and other financial supports.
Check Point... Practices and Data in the Context

• How are these recommendations currently being implemented at my institution?

• What data are currently being collected to track this information and/or facilitate processes related to this recommendation?
MINORITY SERVING INSTITUTIONS AS LEADERS IN DEVELOPMENTAL EDUCATION
Leading in the field...

- Reinforce Fundamental Belief in Human Potential
- Remove Negative Stigmas
- Employ a Holistic Approach
- Provide Academic Supports
- Provide Social Supports
- Provide Financial Support (Parker, 2012)
Supporting Developmental Education Programs in Minority Serving Institutions
Using Research Findings to Guide Practice

- No single set of practices will be effective for every college and its students.

- Colleges will be more successful in improving outcomes for developmental students
  - not by adopting the latest “best practice,”
  - but by adopting a continuous improvement *process* (Schwartz & Jenkins, 2007).
Minority Serving Institutions Success and Developmental Education

- Lobby for exceptions to state policies
- Use alternative means for providing individualized support
- Implement placement policies that best meet the needs of students
- Collect and study outcomes data
  - Form data teams
  - Employ mixed methods techniques for data collection and analysis
- Develop collaborations among Minority Serving Institutions

(Parker, 2012)
Supporting Continuous Evaluation and Improvement

- Consider policies from holistic approach
- Understand the characteristics of students who take developmental courses
- Track students’ progress
- Create opportunities for faculty and staff to
  - Come together each term to examine short- and long-term outcomes of programs.
  - Work together with institutional research staff to evaluate effectiveness of program modifications and new program interventions.
Questions?